Military Participation in Government (MPG) Codebook[1]

The purpose of this data collection project is to develop quantitative indicators of militaries' political power and their relative autonomy in a broad range of countries. Importantly, this project focuses on cabinet and executive council positions held by current and former military officers. This approach allows for the development of relatively continuous indicators of military intrusion into politics, rather than dichotomous indicators—e.g., whether or not there was a coup, whether or not a state is ruled by a "military" regime. This new empirical approach pairs well with theories that treat such concepts as "civilian control of the military" and "military intrusion into politics" as occurring on a continuum rather than as dichotomous phenomena.

Scope and Structure

The scope of this project is all states in the international system from 1964-2008[2] as indicated by the list of states put forward by Gleditsch and Ward (1999) and that are contained in the Archigos project (Goemmans et al 2009)

The project's unit of analysis is country-year. So, coders will be collecting annual observations for each country, e.g., Algeria-1967, Bahrain-1967…Algeria-1968, Bahrain-1968. Coders will be assigned whole countries to code and will code all years (1964-2006). Coders will also code "test cases" in order to ensure inter-coder reliability.

Sources

Coders should consult the *Europa World Year Book*. (JN1 .E85 1964) in McKeldin Library). Each of these sources is organized by year and has entries for each country that contain a roster of each countries' national cabinet/government. These rosters also indicate through abbreviation (e.g., "Gen." for "General") where a cabinet/government member is a military officer.

At this stage of the project, coders should only consult this source. In order to make sure that the same criteria are used for each case, coders should not rely on extraneous Google searches, etc. Any questions about specific cases should be directed to Peter (the project lead).

Definitions

Military

For purposes of this project, a member of the cabinet/government is considered to be part of the military if they hold a military rank—either active duty or retired. The underlying

[2] The selection of this date range for the project is driven by the publication dates of the *Europa World Yearbook* for countries outside of Europe.

rational is that holding a military ranks indicates membership in a military-type organization, and these types of organizations monopolize coercive resources in a country and are engaged in bargaining with the state leader over their relative autonomy and their role in the politics of the state.

Leader:

The leader of the state is whomever Archigos lists as the state's "effective leader." Coders will be provided with this list.

In some years, there are multiple leaders for a country. (for example, in an election year) When this is the case, coders will be provided with separate rows in the spreadsheet for each country-leader (e.g., US-2009-Bush, US-2009-Obama). To determine which leader is the relevant one, coders should simply refer to the *Europa World Year Book* and see which leader is referenced in the cabinet/government section or right under the country name—where the executive positions are listed. If they cannot find the leader, coders should email Peter.

Note that spellings may be slightly different between the names provided on the spreadsheet and the names that appear in the Handbook—this will often be the case with non-Western leaders. Email Peter when unsure about matching a particular leader in the spreadsheet with their counterpart in the Handbook.

A great way to address specific questions is to snap a picture of the relevant page(s) in the *Year Book* and email the picture to Peter with your question.

Cabinet:

"Cabinet positions" are ALL of the OCCUPIED positions listed under "Cabinet" or "National Cabinet" or "The Government" in the *Europa World Year Nook*, but NOT including all those OCCUPIED BY THE LEADER (for example the Ministry of Defense, if it is held by the leader, would not be counted as a Cabinet position and neither would the prime minister position, if it were occupied by the leader). Also to be EXCLUDED should be any Ambassador positions listed (sometimes the state's Ambassador to U.S. or U.K. is listed).

All positions should be included unless they are explicitly described as not being in the cabinet/government—e.g., "ministers not in the government."

Political parties—e.g., the Communist Party—may be listed under "The Government," but should not be counted as part of the cabinet—though, members of the party who occupy cabinet positions should be. **This can sometimes be tricky. Again, the best thing to do is often to take a picture of the relevant entry with your camera phone and email Peter for clarification.**

Sometimes the positions are under separate sub-headings, such as "Ministers," "Secretaries," and "Ministers Delegate." **All positions under all headings should be considered to be cabinet positions aside from those exceptions noted above.**

Note also that Vice President and Deputy Prime Minister positions should also be included as should Prime Minister, President, Premier positions when they are NOT occupied by the leader. When in doubt, email Peter.

Military:

A military officer is anyone who has a military rank next to their name, e.g., Gen., Capt., Col., Adm., in the sources listed above. This includes BOTH retired and active-duty. So "Gen. John Smith" and "Gen. (ret.) John Smith" are both considered to be "military." Note: the ranks in bold are considered to be "junior" (for the "Junior" variable).

Coders should pay attention to any abbreviated title before a cabinet name—it is likely a military rank. If unsure, consult with Peter.

List of Military Officer Ranks from Junior to Senior

- **Lieutenant (Lt.)**
- **Captain (Cpt.)**
- **Major (Maj)**
- **Lieutenant Colonel (LTC)/Commander (Com.)**
- Colonel (Col.)
- Commodore/Cmdr.
- Brigadier General (Brig. Gen.)/Rear Admiral (Adm.)
- Major General (Maj. Gen.)/Vice Admiral (Adm.)
- Lieutenant General (Lt. General)/Admiral (Adm.)
- Colonel General (Col. General)/Fleet Admiral (Adm.)
- General (Gen.)
- Vice Marshall (Vice Mar. or V. Mar.)
- Marshall (Mar.)/Air Marshall

Some other ranks may come up—e.g., "Wing Commander"—if so, just email Peter for clarification.

Retired:

A military officer is considered to be retired if the source indicates that they are—usually with a "ret" next to their military rank. Refer to the discussion of "Military" immediately above "Retired" is a subset of "Military."

Variables to be coded:

General Notes:

- Dichotomous/binary variables should be coded with a 1 to mean "yes" or a 0 to mean "no." Uncertain cases—where the coder is not sure how to code a variable—should be marked with a "?", and cases where the position in question does not exist—i.e., where the variable pertains to the Ministry of Defense and there is no such ministry in the state—cases should be marked as missing with a period—"."

- Where there are multiple positions contained in a single title—e.g., "Minster of Defense and Foreign Affairs"—**the positions should be considered separate for the dichotomous variables—e.g., Mil_MOD and Mil_MOFA—but only counted as one positions when cabinet positions are tallied in the count variables, e.g., Cab_Count. The objective of the *count* variables are to get sense of the "bodies" in a cabinet meeting and how many of them are wearing a uniform, even if one of those "bodies" holds multiple positions.** Another example would be when the leader was "Minister of Defense and Development"—both Leader_MOD and Leader_OTHER would be coded as 1 (and MIL_MOD would be coded as missing, because the position is occupied by the leader and not a cabinet member).

- **For the count variables, with a position like "Minister of Defense and Development"—there is one cabinet-member, but they have both security and non-security responsibilities. In this case, security trumps non-security and it would be counted as a security position in the "count" variables. However, in the binary variables, we would consider each portfolio separately—e.g., if a general were "Minister of Defense and Development," we would code as 1 the Mil_MOD and Mil_Nonsec. However, please flag these cases and indicate the relevant position in "Notes." If a military officer was "Minister of Defense, Development, and Borders," then mil_MOD, mil_nonsec, and mil_sec_other would all be coded as 1.**

- Variables referring to retired military officers, i.e. with the text "_ret" in the variable name are a subset of their parent variable—e.g., they are only coded as either 0 or 1 when their parent variable=1. When their parent variable=0, then they are coded as missing (with ".") Example: mil_MOD=1, then mil_MOD_ret is coded as 0 or 1, when mil_MOD=0, then mil_MOD_ret is always coded as "."

Leader_ NAME:

As recorded in Archigos. This will be provided to the coder. See the discussion above for cases in which there may be multiple state leaders in a given year.

Leader_ID:

As recorded in Archigos. This will be provided to the coder.

Binary Variables

These variables pertain to institutions and positions rather than the count of "bodies" in the cabinet. Here I am interested in the portfolios that the leader or military hold, even if

multiple portfolios are held by one individual. For example, if the state leader is "Minister of Defense and Development," then both Leader_MOD and Leader_OTHER should be coded as 1. If a General is "Minister of Defense, Borders, and Housing." Mil_MOD, Mil_Sec_other and Mil_non_sec should be coded as 1.

Leader_MIL

Coders should refer to the leader listed under Leader_NAME. Is the leader of the state a military officer according to the sources provided? This includes retired or active-duty.

Leader_MIL_RET

(Coded only if Leader_MIL=1, otherwise code as missing) Is the leader of the state a retired military officer?

Leader_CAB

Does the leader hold a cabinet position other than president, prime minister, etc?

Leader_MOD

Is the leader also the minister of defense (MOD)? The following positions are also considered Minister of Defense: "Secretary of Defense," "Minister/Secretary of National Defense," "Minister of War." If none of the aforementioned positions exist, the following shall be considered MOD in the following order: Defense Affairs, National Security, National Security Affairs, Armed Forces, Security (e.g., if all five existed in the cabinet, only Defense Affairs would be considered MOD while the other four would be considered to be "other security.")

If Leader_MOD=1, then Leader_CAB=1 also.

Leader_INT

Is the leader also the Minister of Interior (MOI)? In the absence of an "Interior" position, the following can be considered MOI: Home Affairs, Internal Affairs, Public Security/People's Security, Security, Police, Gendarmerie, Internal Administration, Territorial Administration, Regional Administration, State Administration. Where there is no "Interior" position, but are multiple positions that could be considered to be the MOI, refer to the order of the above list for which should be considered MOI—i.e., Home Affairs should be considered to be MOI over Internal Affairs, etc. When there is no position literally called "Minister of the Interior" pay close attention to the cabinet list for positions that could be considered to be substitutes for the Minister of the Interior—use the above criteria and email Peter if in any doubt.

If Minister of Defense and Interior are the same position—i.e., "Minister of Defense and Interior," then they should be considered separate for the _MOD and _MOJ variables, but counted as a single security position in the count variables.

If Leader_INT=1, then Leader_CAB=1 also.

Leader_MOFA

Is the leader also the minister of foreign affairs? (MOFA) In the absence of a "Foreign Affairs" position—"external affairs," "Secretary of State" (in the case of the U.S.), "international cooperation," or "foreign relations" can be considered to be MOFA.

If Leader_MOFA=1, then Leader_CAB=1 also.

Leader_MOJ

Is the leader, the minister of justice (MOJ)? In the absence of a "Justice" minister, "Legal Affairs," "Law," or "Attorney General" can be considered MOJ. If MOI and MOJ are explicitly the same position, e.g., "Minister of Justice and Interior", they should be considered separate positions for the _MOI and _MOJ variables, but only counted as 1—security—position in the count variables.

If Leader_MOJ=1, then Leader_CAB=1 also.

Leader_OTHER

Does the leader hold any cabinet positions other than MOI, MOD, MOJ, or MOFA?

If Leader_OTHER=1, then Leader_CAB=1 also.

Mil_CAB

Aside from the leader (if s/he is a military officer), are any cabinet positions held by military officers?

Mil_CAB_ret

(Coded only if Mil_CAB=1, otherwise as missing) Aside from the leader, are any cabinet positions held by retired military officers?

Mil_MOD

(Coded only if leader_MOD=0) Does a military officer—other than the state leader—hold the position of Minister of Defense (MOD). The following positions are also considered Minister of Defense: "Secretary of Defense," "Minister/Secretary of National Defense," "Minister of War."

When there is more than one of the preceding positions and the state leader is one of them, then the position held by the state leader should be considered MOD and the second position should be considered "other security."

If none of the aforementioned positions exist, the following shall be considered MOD in the following order: Defense Affairs, National Security, National Security Affairs, Armed Forces. (e.g., if

all four existed in the cabinet, only Defense Affairs would be considered MOD while the other three would be considered to be "other security.")

Mil_MOD_ret

(Coded only if Mil_MOD=1, otherwise as missing) Is the Minister of Defense a retired military officer?

MOD_name

Write the full name—as written in the sources—of the Minister of Defense. This includes both military officers and civilians. Include rank for military officers. If mil_MOD is missing, then this variable should be recorded as missing.

Mil_INT

(Coded only if leader_INT=0) Does a military officer—other than the state leader—hold the position of Minister of Interior (MOI)? In the absence of an "Interior" position, the following can be considered MOI: Home Affairs, Internal Affairs, Public Security/People's Security, Security, Police, Gendarmerie, Internal Administration, Territorial Administration, Regional Administration, State Administration. Where there is no "Interior" position, but are multiple positions that could be considered to be the MOI, refer to the order of the above list for which should be considered MOI—i.e., Home Affairs should be considered to be MOI over Internal Affairs, etc.

When there is no position literally called "Minister of the Interior" pay close attention to the cabinet list for positions that could be considered to be substitutes for the Minister of the Interior—use the above criteria and email Peter if in any doubt.

Mil_INT_ret

(Coded only if Mil_INT=1, otherwise as missing) Is the Minister of Interior a retired military officer?

INT_name

Write the full name—as written in the sources—of the Minister of Interior. This includes both military officers and civilians. Include rank for military officers. If mil_MOI is missing, then this variable should be recorded as "missing"—"."

Mil_MOJ

(Coded only if leader_MOJ=0) Is the minister of justice (MOJ) a military officer? In the absence of a "Justice" minister, "Legal Affairs," "Law," or "Attorney General" can be considered MOJ. If MOI and MOJ are explicitly the same position, e.g., "Minister of Justice and Interior", they should be considered separate positions for the _MOI and _MOJ variables, but not for the count variables below.

Mil_MOJ_ret

(Coded only if Mil_MOJ=1, otherwise as missing) Is the minister of justice a retired military officer?

MOJ_name

Record the full name of the MOJ.

Mil_MOFA

(Coded only if leader_MOFA=0) Is a military officer the minister of foreign affairs? (MOFA) In the absence of a "Foreign Affairs" position—"external affairs," "Secretary of State" (in the case of the U.S.), "international cooperation," or "foreign relations" can be considered to be MOFA.

Mil_MOFA_ret

(Coded only if Mil_MOFA=1, otherwise as missing) Is a retired military officer the minister of foreign affairs? (MOFA)

MOFA_name

Record the full name—without rank—of the MOFA.

Sec_other

This is probably the trickiest part of the coding, and so I anticipate that you will have a lot of questions/emails about this—which is a good thing. Do not hesitate to email with questions.

Are there security-related positions other than MOI, MOD, MOFA, and MOJ?

These would include any position with "security" in the title (escept for "Social Security" and "Food Security"), and also positions involving "borders," "narcotics," "military production," specific military branches, and the police/gendarmerie (when these are separate from the MOI and MOJ).

Positions that refer to the administration of specific, *named* domestic or international territories/countries/regions also count—e.g., Minister of Chittagong Hill Affairs (Bangladesh) or Minister of Mainland Affairs (Taiwan) or Minister of European Affairs for some EU countries, but NOT unnamed territories—e.g., Minister of Rural Affairs. But, the case should be flagged under the "flag" variable where this is the case and an explanation of the relevant position should be put in "Notes." These will be reviewed later to ensure there is a security-connection.

Specific clarifications on "other security":

- "Strategic Affairs" SHOULD be considered security, but NOT "Strategic Planning," which is likely an economic position.
- "Atomic/Nuclear Energy" SHOULD be considered security, but NOT "Energy."

- Secondary MOFA positions, e.g., "International/European Cooperation" SHOULD also be considered security-related. Attorney General or Law or Legal Affairs does NOT count as other security.
- "Territorial/Regional Administration" does NOT count (though it may serve as MOI).
- By itself, "Corrections" or "Prisons" does NOT count as security.

Note that here we are concerned with the portfolios held by individuals rather than the "bodies" in the cabinet. So, if there is an individual that holds multiple security portfolios, like "Minister of Interior, Defense, and Border Security"—then this variable should be coded as 1 because of "Border Security." However, there may be some positions like "Minister of the Interior and Police" where, really there is just one position—an MOI equivalent. This cases will be rare, but you should email Peter to address the specific case when they pop up.

Mil_SEC_other

(Code only if Sec_other=1) Does a military officer—**other than the state leader**—hold any security-related positions other than those designated MOD, MOI, MOFA, or MOJ? (Again, this does not count positions held by the state leader)

If there are no security-related positions other than MOD, MOI, MOJ, or MOFA in the cabinet, this should be coded as "missing"—"."

If there is a single military officer who is "Minister of Defense and Border Security," this variable should be coded as 1, because not only is MOD held by a military officer, an "other" security portfolio, Border Security, is also held—even if it is by the same officer.

Mil_SEC_other_list

Please list the names, as written in the sources consulted, of the security cabinet *positions* considered for a code of 1 under MIL_SEC_other; separate these by semi-colon with no spaces. In parentheses, next to each position, write the full name (without rank) of the military officer holding this position. E.g., Minister of Land Forces (John Doe);Minister of Sea Forces(Jane Doe)

Where there is a single military officer who holds both MOD, MOI, MOFA, or MOJ *AND* an "other security" position—list them here also—e.g., "Minister of Defense, Border Security."

Mil_SEC_other_ret

(Coded only if Mil_SEC_other=1, otherwise as missing) Does a retired military officer—other than the state leader—hold any security-related positions coded under MIL_SEC_other?

Mil_SEC_other_ret_list

Please list the names, as written in the sources consulted, of the security cabinet *positions* considered for a code of 1 under MIL_SEC_other_ret; separate these by semi-colon with no spaces.

Mil_NonSec

Aside from the leader, does a military officer hold any non-security positions in the cabinet? I.e., any positions not covered by Mil_INT, Mil_MOD, Mil_MOJ, Mil_MOFA, or Mil_SEC_other?

Note again, that it is possible that there is a single individual officer that holds multiple portfolios. Here, this variable is coded as 1, if at least one portfolio of a military officer is non-security related. For example, if General John Doe is "Minister of Defense and Construction," both Mil_MOD and Mil_NonSec are coded as 1, because of the "Defense" and "Construction" portfolios.

Mil_NonSec_ret

(Coded only if Mil_NonSec=1, otherwise as missing) Does a retired military officer hold any non-security positions in the cabinet?

Mil_NonSec_list

Please list the names, as written in the sources consulted, of the non-security cabinet *positions* held by military officers, separate these by semi-colon with no spaces. In parentheses, next to each position, write the full name) of the military officer holding this position. E.g., Minister of Development (General John Doe);Minister of Health(Admiral Jane Doe)

Where a single military officer holds a security and non-security position—list the non-security position here. I.e., if we have Admiral Jane Doe-Minister of Public Security, Health—list Minister of Heath (Admiral Jane Doe) and list Minister of Public Security (Admiral Jane Doe) under Mil_SEC_other_list.

Mil_NonSec_ret_list

Please list the names, as written in the sources consulted, of the non-security cabinet *positions* (not the names of the individuals, rather, their *offices*) held by retired military officers, separate these by semi-colon with no spaces.

Count Variables

NOTE: positions held by the leader are not considered in any of these counts. So, for example, if there are four security-related positions in a state listed in the sources: MOJ, MOI, MOD, and MOFA, and the state leader is MOD, then there are only 3 security-related positions as far as the counts are concerned.

Here it is also important to clarify that what is being coded for the count variables is the balance of *individuals* in the cabinet/government, whereas the binary variables are concerned with the positions/portfolios held. In the binary variables, if a single military

officer is "Minister of Defense, Border Security, and Economic Development," then we code three different variables as "1"—Mil_MOD, Mil_sec_other, and Mil_nonsec.

However, in the count variables, we are concerned only with how many individuals would be at a cabinet/government meeting and how many of them are military officers. So, the individual would be counted once in those counts. Further, given that the individual is only counted once, it is necessary to make a decision about whether this individual is categorized as security or non security for the "COUNT_sec" and "COUNT_nonsec" variables. In this case, if an individual's portfolios include any security functions, then they are categorized as "security" and so would be counted under the "COUNT_sec" variables. (Note: that all individuals are counted under the generic Cab_COUNT variables, regardless of whether they are security or non-security.

Note that this means that the binary and count variables won't always match up—and that's ok. For example, if General John Doe is the "Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Defense," then Mil_Nonsec and Mil_MOD will be coded as 1, but he will only be counted as a security position in the count variables. So, it is possible that Mil_Nonsec is 1, but Cab_COUNT_nonsec_mil is 0. That is fine—this coding scheme gives us two ways to approach the question of military representation in the government—looking at portfolios/positions, and also individuals.

Cab_COUNT

Other than those held by the leader, how many people are in the cabinet, i.e., do not count vacant positions and those occupied by the leader. This counts positions occupied by both civilians and military. Do not count positions held by the leader.

Cab_COUNT_mil

Other than those held by the leader—if s/he is a military officer—how many of those in the cabinet are military officers? Do not count positions held by the leader.

Cab_COUNT_mil_ret

(Coded only if Cab_COUNT_mil>0, otherwise as missing) Other than those held by the leader—if s/he is a retired military officer—how many of those in the cabinet are retired military officers? Do not count the leader.

Cab_COUNT_sec

Other than the leader, how many security-related cabinet members are there? These would be MOD, MOI, MOJ, MOFA, and all others who have some portfolio considered under _SEC_other variables. Do not count positions held by the leader.

As stated above, positions that have two portfolios—one security and one non-security (e.g., "Police, Economic Development") are counted here as a security position, not a non-security position. For the count variables, security trumps non-security.

Cab_COUNT_sec_mil

Other than the leader—if s/he is a military officer, how many of those in security-related cabinet positions are military officers?

Cab_COUNT_sec_ret

(Coded only if Cab_COUNT_sec_mil>0, otherwise as missing) Other than the leader, how many security-related cabinet members are retired military officers?

Cab_COUNT_nonsec

Other than the leader, how many non-security-related cabinet members are there? These are any members without positions such as MOD, MOI, MOJ or anything counted under _SEC_other. This counts both positions held by military officers and civilians.

Cab_COUNT_nonsec_mil

How many non-security-related cabinet members are military officers? Do not count positions held by the leader.

Cab_COUNT_nonsec_mil_ret

(Coded only if Cab_COUNT_nonsec_mil>0, otherwise as missing) Other than the leader, how many non-security-related cabinet members are retired military officers?

Other

Junior

Code this as 1 if any of the military officers in this country's cabinet are below the rank of Colonel. If there are no military officers, code this as missing. Refer to the rank list at the beginning of the codebook to determine ranks below Colonel. If no military officers in the cabinet, this is coded as missing.

Junior_ret

Code this as 1 if any of the retired military officers in this country's cabinet are below the rank of Colonel. If no retired military officers in the cabinet, this is coded as missing.

Date_current

Both sources, for each country, should indicate a date at which the information for a cabinet is current, e.g., for some countries the cabinet info in the Handbook of World Politics 2014 is current as of "August 15, 2013." Record this data in MM/DD/YYY format.

Notes

Any notes or general comments/questions. (This will usually be blank)

Flag

Put a 1 here to mark cases for further review. Any case with Flag=1 should have a detailed explanation under Notes. When in doubt, always flag a case for review. Any time Flag=1, there should be brief explanatory notes under "Notes"

Initials

Put your initials here.

Date Complete

Put the date the coding was completed here.